MFAT Management Response to Pacific Islands Forum Fisheries Agency Mid-Term Reviews (2022)

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Evaluation:** | Pacific Islands Forum Fisheries Agency Mid-Term Reviews: Review Report - *South Pacific Tuna Longline Policy and Management, Pacific*  *Islands Port State Measures, and the Catch Documentation and*  *Enhancing Compliance in Pacific Tuna Fisheries* |
|  |  |
| **Date of Unit Manager acceptance of the final evaluation report** | 2 May, 2022 |

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **Approval of the MFAT Management Response (where provided)** | | |
| **Name of Division Manager** | |  |
| **Date:** |  | |
|  |  | |

Glossary

ADDs Activity Design Documents

ANCORS Australian National Centre for Ocean Resources and Security

APR Annual Progress Report

CAM Catch accounting module

CDEC Catch Documentation and Enhancing Compliance in Pacific Tuna Fisheries Activity

CDS Catch Documentation Scheme

CMA/CMS Catch Management Arrangement/Catch Management Scheme

EEZ Exclusive Economic Zone

EM Electronic monitoring

ER Electronic reporting

FFA Pacific Islands Forum Fisheries Agency

FFC Pacific Islands Forum Fisheries Agency Committee

FMA Fisheries Management Adviser

IT Information Technology

M&E Monitoring and Evaluation

MCS Monitoring, Control and Surveillance

MFAT Ministry of Foreign Affairs and Trade, New Zealand

MTR Mid-Term Review

OFP Oceanic Fisheries Programme, SPC

PIC/T Pacific Island Country/Territory

PIPSM Pacific Islands Port State Measures Activity

PNAO Office of the Parties to the Nauru Agreement

PSM Port State Measures

RIMF Regional Information Management Facility (FFA)

RMT Activity Design Document’s Results Management Table

SC Activity Steering Committee

SPC The Pacific Community (Oceanic Fisheries Programme)

SPLL South Pacific Longline Policy and Management Activity

TKA Tokelau Arrangement for the Management of the South Pacific Albacore Fishery

TRP Target Reference Point

TWG The FFA Secretariat PIPSM and CDEC Technical Working Group

WCPFC Western and Central Pacific Fisheries Commission

| OVERARCHING RECOMMENDATIONS | |
| --- | --- |
| Recommendation | Response and Action  (Agree, Partially Agree, Reject) |
| **1. Strengthen senior strategic leadership, management, and engagement**  The Activities require increased strategic oversight, engagement and active management by the senior leadership and management team in the Pacific Islands Forum Fisheries Agency (FFA) Secretariat. This will improve the identification of priorities and the marshalling and coordination of resources appropriate to address the needs for each Activity. This will lead to more cost-effective implementation and increased regional and national benefits flowing from these significant funding opportunities which have limited timeframes. | **Agree**  Since the review, FFA Secretariat staff are meeting regularly to ensure increased senior leadership oversight and management. MFAT will also continue to engage closely with senior leadership and receive progress updates through regular meetings. |
| **2. Boost the technical and policy support**  Staff with professional Monitoring, Control and Surveillance (MCS) experience, particularly with experience in Port State Measures (PSM) and Catch Documentation Scheme (CDS) and multilateral fisheries management, need to be assigned to these Activities to provide support to the Activity Manager and the CDS Technical Adviser. Such expertise could be sourced by dedicating additional Fisheries Management Adviser (FMA) resources to the Activity. If that expertise is not available in FFA, then external expertise should be secured under contract. Technical and policy capacity and capability to support the South Pacific Longline Policy and Management (SPLL) Activity also requires boosting. | **Agree**  Since the review, FFA has recruited to ensure it has a full team including MCS technical staff and FMAs. Minimum required qualifications and technical skills have been raised in recent recruiting campaigns to provide additional technical capacity.  Specific MCS technical staff and FMAs have been assigned respective projects.  It is anticipated that through the cross-divisional TWG, any emerging technical and policy capacity needs will be identified and addressed. If in-house support is unavailable in a given timeframe, all three projects have funds to source external support.  Project reports to provide updates on ongoing professional capacity under ‘Governance and Management’ section to facilitate ongoing monitoring by both FFC and MFAT.  If FFA is unable to demonstrate sufficient improvement by September 2022, conditions for the FFA core funding (WPG-0102816) will be reviewed to incentivise FFA to adequately resource and support projects. |
| **3. Increase engagement with Pacific Islands Forum Fisheries Agency Committee (FFC)**  The Mid-Term Review (MTR) recommends that engagement with FFC be strengthened with the submission of succinct annual reports and plans for the next reporting period. This will provide an opportunity for increased visibility and ownership by members and potentially provide an additional vehicle for enhanced engagement. | **Agree**  FFC to receive Information Paper highlighting MTR findings and proposed management response. FFC to receive and discuss subsequent annual reports and plans for the next reporting period as recommended in the MTR. |
| **4. Re-establish the Technical Working Group (TWG)**  The TWG should be formally re-established with the oversight and direction of executive anagement. The MTR recommends that the TWG has a clear terms of reference, executive management oversight and inter-Divisional engagement across the Secretariat (the Legal Unit, Fisheries Operations, Information Technology (IT), Fisheries Management and Fisheries Development). The terms of reference should set a regular meeting schedule, agree to tasks, roles, and responsibilities, and hold colleagues to account in terms of expectations. | **Agree**  FFA has re-established a cross-divisional TWG with executive management oversight for MFAT projects. A TWG TOR will ensure discussion topics are targeted and strategic, covering matters relating to implementation and any emerging issues that require specific focus and coordination. Meeting records will be maintained and reported through to the SC.  Consideration is also being given to establishing a project oversight committee looking at all projects implemented by the agency, including those funded by the United Nations Development Programme, the Pacific EU Marine Partnership Programme and the World Bank. |
| **5. Strengthen the Steering Committee’s (SC) role**  The role of the SC needs to be strengthened to achieve the oversight role envisaged in the Activity Design Documents (ADDs) for the three Activities, which included strategic guidance and monitoring progress.  The SC’s role in the governance of all three activities can be strengthened by requiring a succinct executive summary of the Annual Progress Report (APR) prepared within one month of the end of the reporting period. The executive summary would simply extract key issues from the APR. The draft APR for the most recent reporting period, a finance report and an updated Results Management Table (RMT) would be included as annexes to the executive summary.  The executive summary should provide the basis of substantive discussion in the SC. Draft minutes for meetings of the SC should be circulated to SC participants within two weeks of the conclusion of the SC. Final reports, incorporating any feedback received, including revisions to the RMT, should be circulated to participants, or placed on a dedicated secure page on the FFA website, within six weeks of the conclusion of the SC. The current practice of delayed distribution of SC meeting reports, sometimes 12 months after the event, is poor practice. | **Agree**  A succinct executive summary of the APR to be prepared within one month of the end of the reporting period and tabled at SC meetings with recommendations from the FFA Secretariat. The finance report and an updated RMT will be included as annexes. Discussions at the SC to be structured around key issues and focus on achieving results.  The SC agenda to include a workshop session on how the SC’s strategic guidance role can be strengthened in projects. The SC TOR to then be revised accordingly. |
| **6. Support a review of FFA’s Information Management Services**  Based on evidence presented to the MTR Team in relation to the three New Zealand Ministry of Foreign Affairs and Trade (MFAT)-support Activities, the MTR supports the need for an urgent comprehensive review of FFA’s IT services. The review should focus on the delineation of IT focus areas between corporate systems and MCS operations systems and clearer division of responsibility and accountability of these between Corporate Services and Fisheries Operations. | **Agree**  As part of the business plan implementation a number of service delivery and governance reviews are under way including of the FFA information management services. FFA to incorporate the results of these reviews to align services to member needs. Progress to be reported regularly to the FFC and ARC.  If FFA is unable to demonstrate sufficient improvement by September 2022, conditions for the FFA core funding (WPG-0102816) will be reviewed to incentivise FFA to review its IT services and support to projects. |
| **7. Address the gender issues**  Although the situation is reported to have improved recently, there is an immediate need to address any outstanding issues connected to the three MFAT Activities. It is also recommended that Activity management strengthen reporting systems to capture gender disaggregated information for the remaining period of implementation of the three Activities. | **Agree**  FFA is in the process of hiring a gender and social inclusion specialist who will be well positioned to provide guidance on how gender considerations can be better integrated into the three activities. Moreover, in 2022, FFA has scheduled a gender workshop to improve gender consideration and reporting across all FFA operations. MFAT to continue to monitor progress. |
| **8. Improve meeting and Activity management**  General project management focussing on (i) document management and (ii) meeting support also requires attention. This would be achieved by a combination of increased supervisory roles for the relevant manager, and/or planning for staff to receive intense project management training. | **Agree**  FFA project teams to work with the FFA Corporate Service Division (and other relevant teams) to strengthen document management and how meeting support is provided.  The FFA Secretariat to investigate and progress options for rolling out off-the-shelf project management tools across the organisation.  Staff are to be offered training and coaching on project management, project management tools, reporting and monitoring and evaluation (including its use in adaptive management).  Project reports to provide updates on ongoing professional capacity under ‘Governance and Management’ section to facilitate ongoing monitoring by both FFC and MFAT.  If FFA is unable to demonstrate sufficient improvement by September 2022, conditions for the FFA core funding (WPG-0102816) will be reviewed to incentivise FFA to support improved document management and meeting support for projects. |
| **9. Strengthen monitoring and evaluation (M&E)**  M&E practices and processes also need considerable strengthening across the Pacific Islands Port State Measures (PIPSM), Catch Documentation and Enhancing Compliance in Pacific Tuna Fisheries (CDEC) and SPLL Activities. The SC needs to examine the APRs more closely and RMT updates to better monitor Activity implementation and enable timelier response/s to any challenges. | **Agree**  The FFA Secretariat is to engage an M&E specialist and establish a team to lead the strengthening of monitoring, evaluation, and learning within the organisation (including at a project level).  Project managers to be trained/coached to better meeting the M&E responsibilities of their respective projects.  Reflections on progress against the output and outcome indicators in the RMT, the testing of assumptions and adaptations required are to be a standing agenda item in the projects’ Steering Committee meetings. |
| **10. Financial considerations - overarching**  The MTR also noted a lack of clarity in relation to the application of FFA’s Management Fee and Management Support Fees. Data provided to the MTR indicate that there is no consistency in the way these items are budgeted, or expenditure reported. It is recommended that these components of Activity finances be reviewed. | **Agree**  The FFA Audit and Risk Committee (on which MFAT also sits) will receive a second report regarding the application of fees across FFA in May 2022. The outcome of the meeting to be documented in a policy document and will inform future budgets. |

| PACIFIC ISLANDS PORT STATE MEASURES, AND THE CATCH DOCUMENTATION & ENHANCING COMPLIANCE IN PACIFIC TUNA FISHERIES COMMON RECOMMENDATIONS | |
| --- | --- |
| Recommendation | Response and Action  (Agree, Partially Agree, Reject) |
| **11. Pilot PIPSM and CDEC initiatives**  The PIPSM and the CDEC Activities should offer opportunities to two or three FFA Pacific Island Country (PIC) members who have demonstrated a keen interest in engaging in the respective Activity to provide the platform for piloting Activity implementation.  The rationale is that, at the end of the Activity, more lessons will be available from the appraisal of a small number of comprehensively planned and implemented pilots than a broad regional endeavour that attempts to engage all FFA members who have a diverse range of needs and interests regarding PSM and CDS. | **Partially Agree**  PIPSM grant funding arrangement to be extended until 31 July 2022 to give time for FFA to host a technical workshop with members in June 2022, and agree a realistic way forward that has buy in from the membership. One option presented to members should include a multi-staged implementation strategy that includes piloting activities in up to three PICs that have a clear interest in engaging (thus laying the foundations for a broader roll out in the future). A second option, should present a rationalised workplan and reduced budget for the two projects focused on those activities that are likely to deliver the greatest impacts.  Once costed workplans for the projects are agreed, RMT indicator targets and risk registers should be reviewed accordingly, and grant funding arrangements varied. |
| **12. Promote synergies with PIPSM and CDEC Activities**  The potential linkages between the PIPSM and the CDEC Activities are particularly strong with much of the work programmed for support under the PIPSM serving as foundational for the CDEC. However, these have not materialised four years into the implementation of both Activities. More thought needs to go into how the synergies between these Activities will be achieved. | **Partially Agree**  At noted in (11), PIPSM grant funding arrangement to be extended until 31 July 2022 to give time for FFA to host a technical workshop with members in June 2022, and agree a realistic way forward that has buy in from the membership. The options presented to members should consider how the two Activities can be woven together to maximise synergies, efficiencies and impact. |
| **13. Fast-track development of SPC’s e-CDS support tools**  It is recommended that SPC fast-track the further development of its e-CDS support tools.  Opportunities to engage with FFA Secretariat’s IT should be provided in relation to this, particularly in relation to linkages to the Regional Information Management Facility (RIMF), but these engagement efforts should not constrain the Pacific Community’s (SPC’s) progress in addressing this need.  In consultation with FFA management, SPC should be invited to prepare a programme of work, with associated budget, for consideration under the CDEC Activity to support this action. | **Agree**  As part of the options for the future CDEC workplan as discussed in (11), SPC should be invited to present new costed activities reflecting the fast-tracking of the e-CDS support tools and engagement with the IT Department at FFA Secretariat in relation to RIMF linkages.  Any agreed changes will then be reflected in a variation to the MFAT-FFA grant funding arrangement, and the letter of agreement between FFA and SPC. |

| PACIFIC ISLANDS PORT STATE MEASURES, AND THE CATCH DOCUMENTATION RECOMMENDATIONS | |
| --- | --- |
| Recommendation | Response and Action  (Agree, Partially Agree, Reject) |
| **14. Revisit the Brisbane inter-agency workshop’s recommendations**  The 2019 workshop provided sound advice for a programme of work for support under the CDEC.  Most of that work remains unattended to. It is recommended that the revised Implementation Plan incorporate:   * development of a CDS Activity Communications Strategy * complete more detailed analysis of national supply chains for FFA Members’ tuna products as country visits permit * commission a fresh discussion paper to inform members consideration of national, sub-regional and regional e-CDS, as proposed by the Brisbane Workshop * commission an analysis of the potential costs to FFA Members of a regional e-CDS * compared to nationally implemented e-CDS and assesses these against the benefits. Include a discussion of the short- and long-term resourcing implications, and the potential for cost recovery. * support the development and implementation of national and regional e-CDS through laws, regulations, licensing, agreements, contracts, etc, regulating fishing, fish processing and fish trading operators. | **Partially Agree**  As part of the options for the future CDEC and PIPSM workplans as discussed in (11), the CDEC workplan should look to address some or all of a reduced list of outstanding items from the 2019 BNE workshop report.   * develop a communication strategy for both the CDEC and PIPSM projects. * present a preliminary report canvassing possible CDS options to the CDEC Workshop 2 to socialise and gain agreement on the preferred options. * commission an indepth discussion paper and cost-benefit analysis to inform members consideration of a regional e-CDS. The outcome to be tabled and discussed at a dedicated CDS (and PSM) meeting in June 2022. |
| **15. Re-examine needs of CDEC**  When the CDEC and PIPSM Activities were conceived there was a strong sense that a regional approach would be of broad benefit and that the outcomes would apply to all FFA members. In the early stages of working towards this, it became apparent that countries are at different stages in considering both PSM and CDS and needs and priorities were not necessarily shared by all members.  Given the delays since early work was undertaken to profile the status of national CDS and taking account of the work proposals that remain relevant from the Brisbane workshop, a rapid re-assessment of (i) the status, and (ii) CDS needs of FFA PIC members would be valuable for planning future CDEC support. | **Agree**  A rapid re-assessment of the status and CDS needs of PIC members to be reflected in the revised workplan and budget as part of the options for the future CDEC and PIPSM workplans as discussed in (11). |
| **16. Financial considerations for PIPSM and CDEC**  The MTR recommends that the PIPSM be extended, at no-cost, to at least May 2023. Priority work in the time remaining includes:   * develop a Communication Strategy that profiles PSM-related developments in the FFA region and the support available through the PIPSM Activity * promote PSM-related policy and legislative review and development support available through the PIPSM Activity * fast track the development of the e-PSM prototype which aligns with the regional PSM framework and facilitates the transition from manual to electronic systems * revise the risk assessment criteria for PSM * strengthen inter-agency (FFA, SPC and Office of the Parties to the Nauru Agreement (PNAO)) coordination for regional data standards (includes CDS) to clarify data standards (minimum requirements), promote interoperability, clarify, and develop data sharing potential and confirm data sources * support FFA members’ engagement in the Western and Central Pacific Fisheries Commission (WCPFC) Conservation and Management Measures 2017-02 * support national training needs assessment and support capacity building including through additional Dockside Boarding and Inspection Training * undertake a study of containerisation in Pacific regional ports to assess potential gaps in port state measure processes that may serve as loophole for illegal, unreported, and unrelated fishing.   To maximise the potential benefits to regional and national CDS that the CDEC Activity opportunity provides, the MTR recommends that, subject to the preparation of a practical and realistic implementation plan, and commitments by the FFA Secretariat in regarding to strengthening policy and technical support to the Activity, a no-cost extension to at least October 2024 be considered. | **Partially Agree**  The options for the future CDEC and PIPSM workplans as discussed in (11) should look to accommodate some or all of these priority work areas, subject to member interest, ability to deliver in a timely manner and level of impact these areas of work will deliver.  Once the workplans have been agreed following the June technical workshop as discussed in (11), the implementation plan, budget, results framework and risk register for both PIPSM and CDEC to be revised accordingly, and reflected in no-cost extensions to the MFAT-FFA grant funding agreements extending the agreements (length of extensions are subject to agreements following the June 2022 workshop). |

| SOUTH PACIFIC TUNA LONGLINE POLICY AND MANAGEMENT RECOMMENDATIONS | | |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Recommendation | Response and Action  (Agree, Partially Agree, Reject) |
| **17. Revise the Activity logic**  The Activity logic requires significant revision to reflect the changed strategy for the SPLL associated with the 2017 decision by the TKA to suspend consultations associated with the Catch Management Arrangement (CMA). The revision should be undertaken in close consultation with SPC and MFAT. | **Agree**  To revise the SPLL results framework (outputs, outcomes, indicators, baselines, targets and M&E plan), and reflect relevant changes in a variation to the grant funding arrangement. |
| **18. Maintain SPC’s capacity to provide on-going scientific advice**  It is recommended that SPC Oceanic Fisheries Programme (OFP) be invited to propose a two-year programme of work to continue its SPLL support to May 2024. Activities could include:   * in collaboration with FFA regarding economic implications, evaluate catch reduction pathways to achieve the Target Reference Point (TRP) * provide technical support to catch allocation discussions, including whether effort, catch or capacity-based in relation to both high seas and Exclusive Economic Zones (EEZs) * evaluate compatibility and relationships between different management regimes with the intent to provide a ‘common currency’ across alternative management regimes * support the harvest strategy work SPC is doing for the Commission * provide information, including capacity building, to national fisheries administrations regarding the implementation and monitoring of management schemes * development of E-products, electronic reporting (ER) and electronic monitoring (EM), to improve the timeliness and quality of longline data * continue the design and development of national catch monitoring tools to enhance members’ management capabilities, including data systems to utilise real-time data to provide reports (zone catch status, etc), catch visualisation tools and predicative, what-if scenario tools * integrate southern longline modules into SPC’s tuna data and stock assessment workshops * support a Pacific Island Fishery Professional position at the OFP   The MTR recommends that NZ$1.5 million be transferred from SPLL Activity Outputs 2, 3 and 5 to Output 1 and 4 to support this work. | **Partially Agree**  SPC has presented a new two-year workplan and budget up to the value of NZD 0.64m reflecting a selection of the proposed activities, including supporting of the harvest strategy work which is agreed to be the most pressing challenge. This change is then be reflected in a variation to the MFAT-FFA grant funding arrangement, and the letter of agreement between FFA and SPC. |
| **19. Continue the work on game theory and build on Australian National Centre for Ocean Resources and Security’s (ANCORS) work**  The MTR is supportive of work on game theory continuing, on the basis that it is jointly supervised by FFA economists in the Fisheries Development Division and FFA fisheries managers in the Fisheries Management Division.  The ANCORS initiative could provide the platform needed to re-invigorate discussions among FFA members on longline fisheries management. This work needs to be closely supervised by the Fisheries Management Division in the Secretariat. | **Partially Agree**  The MTR support for the work on game theory is noted, but it is acknowledged that this contract with the Environmental Defence Fund (EDF) on game theory has ended. FFA and SPC will now integrate this into their broader work programme going forward.  Zone-based management is the agreed management approach for managing longline fisheries in FFA waters (including SPA). The focus has shifted to allocating and implementing in-zone limits. To maximise the chance of success, FFA is to develop and execute an intentional engagement strategy with Members as part of the revised implementation plan. The ANCORS contract is also to be extended to complete their contracted work on SPA zone-based limits. |
| **20. Commission a political mapping exercise of all non-FFA members**  The MTR recommends that the SPLL commission a political mapping exercise that reviews the role and future aspirations of all key non-FFA stakeholders in the southern longline fishery as background information to support further discussion on candidate strategies for FFA members to engage and respond. | **Partially agree**  This recommendation is partially addressed through the FFA Secretariat’s strategic mapping initiated in 2019, and a specific mapping for the South Pacific Albacore currently under way. FFA to ensure these maps are updated on a regular basis for Members’ use. |
| **21. National catch management accounting module**  The work anticipated through the development of a business case for the development of the catch management scheme (CMS) is still of potential significant national and regional benefit for FFA PICs engaged in the southern longline fishery.  The overall purpose of the original proposal in 2018 was to document the technical requirements, definitions, and specifications to support the design and development of a national catch accounting module (CAM) within a regional CMS system which was anticipated to be a first significant step towards the successful implementation of the CMS. The work was to include a review of existing national, regional, and sub-regional fisheries IMS in the context of developing the national CAM, on the basis that IMS are already collecting the main base data for the CAM. It would provide the basis for the development of a conceptual model that will assist in strengthening an understanding of needs and the elaboration of functional and technical specifications.  The MTR recommends this initiative be resurrected, the terms of reference be reviewed and agreed, and the drafting of a business case be commissioned. | **Partially agree**  National level implementation of zone-based limits remains an important area for FFA support. Revised outputs are now focused on national level support and the development of sub-regional management arrangements. This may include a national catch management accounting visualisation tool should any members seek support for such an undertaking. |
| **22. Promote synergies with the CDEC Activity**  While this functionality has not yet been effectively elaborated in either the CDEC Activity or the SPLL Activity, SPC has proceeded to develop prototype catch visualisation tools that, utilising ER from vessels among other data sources, provide PIC members with a facility to monitor and reconcile reported catches against limits, landings, and exports, including export destinations. This is important as it will embed CDS as part of national and regional fishery management arrangements, a key integral linkage which currently receives little apparent consideration.  It is recommended that the prototype be tested for broad implementation across TKA members, in the first instance. | **Partially agree**  Revised implementation plan and budget from SPC to include piloting a prototype, but its implementation will be subject to FFA Members indicating interest during consultations for the rapid assessment on the status of CDS (recommendation 15 refers). |
| **23. Financial considerations for SPLL**  Based on the information available to the MTR, the drawdown of funds under the SPLL Activity to the end of 2020 amounted to 25% of the total Activity budget. Approximately 43% of the PIPSM Activity budget had been drawn down and for the CDEC Activity total drawdown of funds to the end of 2020 was 17% of the total budget.  The MTR is of the view that, given the significance of the South Pacific albacore to the fisheries of FFA PIC members, and on-going issues associated with the management of longline fisheries harvesting SPA, a no-cost extension of two years, through until October 2024, for SPLL is justifiable.  On this basis, it is recommended that SPC be invited to prepare a detailed proposal for the application of an additional NZ$1.5 million towards efforts (across Outputs 1 and 4) over a two-year extension of the SPLL Activity. It is recommended that the additional NZ$1.5 million be sourced from Output 2 (NZ$200,000), Output 3 (NZ$500,000) and Output 5 (NZ$800,000).  It is recommended that FFA prepare a complementary two-year programme of work supported by the balance remaining in the Activity: approximately NZ$3.822 million.  Detailed work plans for this period should be prepared by the FFA secretariat and SPC and comprehensively reviewed at the next Steering Committee. | **Agree**  The implementation plan, budget, results framework and risk register for SPLL to be revised accordingly, and reflected in a no-cost variation to the MFAT-FFA grant funding agreement extending agreement through to 30 April 2025 (with implementation concluding in December 2024). |